

DESIGN REVIEW

CHALLENGING URBAN AESTHETIC CONTROL



EDITED BY

BRENDA CASE SCHEER & WOLFGANG F. E. PREISER

Contents

Foreword		vii
Elizabeth Plater-Zyberk	<i>Principal, DPZ Architects, Inc., Miami, FL</i>	
Preface		xv
Wolfgang F. E. Preiser	<i>University of Cincinnati</i>	
Contributors		xix
Introduction: The Debate on Design Review		1
Brenda Case Scheer	<i>University of Cincinnati</i>	
I ISSUES IN DESIGN REVIEW		
<hr/>		
1 Democracy and Design		13
John Delafons	<i>University of Reading, United Kingdom</i>	
2 Reviewing New Design in Historic Districts		20
Ellen Beasley	<i>Historic Preservation Consultant, Houston, Texas</i>	
3 Can the Process of Architectural Design Review Withstand Legal Scrutiny?		31
Richard Tseng-yu Lai	<i>Arizona State University at Tempe</i>	
4 The Abuse of Discretionary Power		42
Brian W. Blaesser, Esq.	<i>Rudnick & Wolfe, Attorneys, Chicago</i>	
5 Design Review and Conservation in England: Historical Development and Contemporary Relationships		51
John V. Punter	<i>University of Strathclyde, Glasgow</i>	
6 Design Review from the Inside		62
Bernard J. Frieden	<i>Massachusetts Institute of Technology</i>	
II DESIGN REVIEW IN PRACTICE		
<hr/>		
7 Discovering Suburban Values through Design Review		75
Gary Hack	<i>Massachusetts Institute of Technology</i>	
8 Design Review Comes to Phoenix		85
Grady Gammage, Jr.	<i>Gammage & Burnham Attorneys at Law, Phoenix, Arizona</i>	

9	Santa Fe Styles and Townscapes: The Search for Authenticity	95
	Harry Moul <i>Planner, City of Santa Fe</i>	
10	Transforming Suburbia: The Case Study of Bellevue, Washington	111
	Mark L. Hinshaw <i>Urban Design Consultant, Bellevue, Washington</i>	
11	Discretionary Design Review: Shaping Downtown Cincinnati	119
	Hayden May <i>Miami University of Ohio</i>	
12	The New England Life: Design Review in Boston	133
	Allan D. Wallis <i>University of Colorado at Denver</i>	

III CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES OF DESIGN REVIEW

13	Place-Making and Design Review	147
	Michael Hough <i>York University, Toronto</i>	
14	Carbuncles, Columns, and Pyramids: Lay and Expert Evaluations of Contextual Design Strategies	156
	Linda N. Groat <i>University of Michigan, Ann Arbor</i>	
15	Local Architectural Language and Contextualism	165
	Anthony D. Radford <i>University of Adelaide, Australia</i>	
16	Disciplinary Society and the Myth of Aesthetic Justice	175
	Patrick J. Poulter <i>Architect, Santa Barbara, California</i>	
17	Private Design Review in Edge City	187
	David J. Baab <i>Planning Consultant, Irvine, California</i>	
18	Battery Park City: An American Dream of Urbanism	197
	Francis P. Russell <i>University of Cincinnati</i>	
	Epilogue	210
	Witold Rybczynski <i>University of Pennsylvania</i>	
	Index	213

DESIGN REVIEW

CHALLENGING URBAN AESTHETIC CONTROL

EDITED BY

BRENDA CASE SCHEER & WOLFGANG F. E. PREISER

Though aesthetic legislation is now common practice in most cities and jurisdictions, the architecture literature has failed to address the issues and problems in this area. This volume corrects this omission by offering guidelines on creating and administering a design review program.

Internationally recognized authorities on design review in architecture, urban planning, historic preservation, land use law, and urban policy discuss legal, procedural, and philosophical aspects of the subject, giving the reader a broad, multidisciplinary perspective. The book provides new ideas and practical advice on design review, with case studies from diverse historic, suburban, and urban communities. Inherent conflicts and inconsistencies in the concept of design control are also explored, enabling the reader to make design review decisions with confidence.

Covering the latest developments in the widespread practice of design review, this pioneering volume will benefit architects, urban planners and policymakers, land use attorneys, and historic preservation professionals who must create, apply, or participate in design regulation.

Brenda Case Scheer and Wolfgang F. E. Preisner are at the University of Cincinnati, Ohio



Chapman & Hall
One Penn Plaza
New York, NY 10119

2-6 Boundary Row
London SE1 8HN

Printed in U.S.A.

ISBN 0-412-99161-6

